American International Journal of Business Management (AIJBM)
ISSN- 2379-106X, *www.aijbm.com Volume 4, Issue 11 (November-2021), PP 106-115*

FOREIGN OUTSOURCING AND OFFSHORING AMONG MULTINATIONALENTERPRISES IN NIGERIA: BLESSINGS AND CURSES

[1]Akpan, Ekom Etim; [2]Okechi Obiora Anthony; [3]Rev. Fr. Dr. Anthony Aniagbaoso Igwe
[1,2,3]Department of Management, Faculty of Business Administration University of Nigeria.

Abstract: This study explores the concepts of foreign outsourcing and off-shoring in the domain of multinational corporations in Nigeria. The study followed a qualitative approach, while data were generated via interviews of twenty-two respondents from eleven multinational corporations. The respondents were drawn from telecommunications, manufacturing and oil services firms using purposive and snowball sampling techniques. The study concluded that foreign outsourcing and offshoring can be blessings or curses to the multinational corporation depending on how and when they are employed. Therefore, to enjoy the benefits of outsourcing and offshoring, the multinationals should ensure that, the costs of producing in-house is not more than the cost of outsourcing or offshoring. Furthermore, it was suggested that future studies should include more participants and sectors in order to generalize the findings.

Keywords: Foreign outsourcing, Off-Shoring, Multinational corporations, Blessings, Curses.

I. Introduction

Multinational corporations contribute immensely to the development and growth of world economy (Eluka, Uzoamaka, & Anekwe, 2015; Dan-Jumbo, & Akpan, 2018). They create job opportunities as well as help in manpower development, technology transfer, and provision of quality goods and services (Francis, Igwe, & Victor-Ifeanyi, 2020; Ivwurie, & Akpan, 2021). However, in order to perform and achieve these goals, the multinationals employ several strategies. Among these strategies are foreign outsourcing and off-shoring. In modern international business management, foreign outsourcing and offshoring are rated among the most powerful strategies usedby successful multinational enterprises(Mostafa, & Roorda, 2017).

Foreign outsourcing refers to an agreement in which a firm contracts a foreign firm to be responsible for the formulation and development of an existing planned activity which could have been done internally (Asatiani, Penttinen, & Kumar, 2019). Foreign outsourcing offers greater budget flexibility and control. It is further perceived to aid reduction inrecruitment and training costs, minimizes operating expenses and helpin risk management (Yeboua, 2020). More importantly, foreign outsourcing allows local firms to gain access to a large pool of talents (Aleksandre, Uday, Esko, Mikko, & Timo, 2019; Ross, 2020).

On the other hand, offshoring is an organisational practice of relocating a firm's production facility to a foreign country. This practice is common in China, Taiwanand other Asian countries where several American and European firms have transferred their manufacturing plants to, with the hope of accessing cheap labour and large market. Other reasons for offshoring by Ross (2020) include possible tax breaks, accessibility to raw materials, shorter supply chain and higher productivity. However, despite the importance of foreign outsourcing and offshoring, they also contribute to job loss, over-reliance on foreigners and information risk (Abdullahi, & Sallau, 2019).

Having observed the consequences of foreign outsourcing and offshoring to multinationals and the economy at large. The focus or concentration is no longer whether these strategies make financial or managerial sense but how and when to employ these strategies. Hence, this article provides a scrupulous discussion on the concepts and theories of foreign outsourcing and offshoring, their benefits (blessings) and drawbacks (curses).

II. Review of Literature

2.1 Theoretical Underpinnings of Foreign Outsourcing and Offshoring

The concepts of outsourcing and offshoring are supported by several theories. However, this study derives its theoretical strength from the transaction cost economics theory, core competency theory and agency theory. These theories are discussed below:

Transaction Cost Economics

The Transaction Cost Economics (TCE) theory has traditionally been the most widely-used outsourcing theory. The transaction cost concept was formally proposed by Ronald Coase in 1937 to explain the existence of firms. He theorised that transactions via market mechanisms incur cost, particularly the costs of searching for exchange partners and making and enforcing contracts. The TCE theory is thought to provide the greatest decision-making tools, assisting managers in determining which of their function should be outsourced and then preparing themselves to undertake the appropriate organizational changes as a result of outsourcing (Rindfleisch, 2020).

Notable transaction cost literature explores both capabilities and transaction costs as factors of corporations' internalization of activities.According to Argyres and Zenger (2012), transaction costs and capabilities are intimately connected over time: previous management decisions impact capability development, which influences future management decisions. Recent research has concentrated on explaining the relationship between capabilities and transaction costs.

According to transaction cost economics philosophy, a company needs to offset transaction and manufacturing costs while deciding whether to insource or outsource (Charles, 2013). If it is more cost effective than purchasing a comparable service feature from a third party, organizations sell a service function in-house. Where processing costs are heavy, the company prefers to offer the service feature internally rather than purchasing it from an outside vendor for this purpose. Transaction cost economics is widely acknowledged as one of the most effective decision-making tools for assisting companies in deciding to outsource and preparing for future outsourcing arrangements. This aids in the successful decision-making process when it comes to outsourcing. Even if it has some drawbacks, especially when it comes to the asset transfers that are required to outsource activities. The lesser the asset transaction conditions, the easier the establishment of more robust and informative contracts and as well, the greater the likelihood of contracting an operation and vice versa. To put it another way, an operation is outsourced if the net benefit after - revenue and lowering expenses is greater than the total outsourcing processing costs.

Core Competencies Theory

The Core Competencies Theory was developed by Prahalad and Hamel (1990) and is based on the theory of resources. Prahalad and Hamel (1990) noted that core competencies are the general knowledge available in an organisation, particularly as regard to the methods of combining different productive skills and the integration methods of various different technologies. Core competencies theory is popular in the outsourcing literature (Hayler, 2015). In an earlier study, Pinnington and Woolcock (1995) investigated core competencies theory and its relationship with business operations, they found that IT system of a firm can be enhance through external skills. According to the core competencies approach, the fundamental component determining the success of a firm is the study of the vendor's capabilities. Additionally, core competencies theory has been used to explain relationship management.

Agency Theory

The agency theory was proposed by Jensen and Meckling (1976).In outsourcing, the agency theory explainsthe relationship between outsourcing organization (outsourcer)and service provider (vendor) and the incentive of the vendor and client to implement outsourcing services (Perunovic & Pedersen, 2007; Wang, & Zhou, 2021). According to Logan (2000), the focus of the agency theory in international business is the development of the most efficient outsourcing contract between the principal and agent. Thus, the theory assume that the parties are self-interested people and corporations (Wang, & Zhou, 2021).

2.2 Conceptual Review

Foreign Outsourcing

Outsourcing is not a new phenomenon in the world of managerial practice and international business. In fact, outsourcing is noted to be among the most powerful strategy in modern management (Kayumba, 2019).Although there is no commonly agreed definition of the outsourcing, it is generallyreferred to as the procuring of material, managerial inputs or services by a company from sources outside the firm (Abdullahi, & Sallau, 2019). Outsourcing is a business practice through which organisation provides itself the possibility of mobilizing scarce resources (time and finance) and direct them to the development of its core competitive characteristics, in the same time achieving better results from its business processes (Agyemang, Aikins, Asibey, & Osei-Broni, 2014). Furthermore, Kayumba (2019) submits that foreign outsourcing helps local firms to transfer some functions to foreign specialised in those functions, hence allowing the firm to generate greater value by giving attention to their core activities.

Outsourcing some tasks and/or processes makes sense for a variety of reasons, including cost minimisation, enhanced capacity to focus on strategic concerns, access to technology and specialized expertise, and the opportunity to demand tangible and superior quality of service.Outsourcing varies from partnerships, collaborations, or strategic alliances in that the flow of resources is one-way, from the vendor to the outsourcer; financial rewards or mutual contribution are often not usual practices (Belcourt, 2006).

Foreign outsourcing has recently received enormous attention among managers of multinational corporations and international management scholars(Clark, 2007; Aigbavboa, & Mbohwa, 2020). Foreign outsourcing is the practice of having goods or services produced or processed byanother company located outside of a company's home country. For example, Innoson Vehicle Manufacturing Company Limited, a Nigerian vehicle manufacturing and assembling firm contracting the manufacturing of some of its vehicles components to Toyota Motors a Japanese car company. The reasons for foreign outsourcing are as varied as the companies that use this operational strategy, companies typically outsource to gain greater economies of scale, trade in wide range markets, ensures high quality of service and lower cost of operations (Kayumba, 2019; Aigbavboa, & Mbohwa, 2020). Also, outsourcing allows the outsourcer focus on its core activities (Aigbavboa, & Mbohwa, 2020). However, in developing countries most companies outsource to foreign firms in order to have access to advanced technology and higher technical know-how (Abdullahi, & Sallau, 2019).

Offshoring

Offshore outsourcing of jobs in manufacturing and other sectors have been occurring for decades in the world economy (Brainard, & Litan, 2004). Differentiating offshoring with foreign outsourcing has been controversially. While some authors see the two as same, others do not (Brainard, & Litan, 2004; Erber, & Sayed-Ahmed, 2005). Although most scholars agree that offshoring is the relocation of a business process from one country to another—typically an operational process, such as manufacturing, or supporting processes, such as accounting (Farrell, 2004; Okeke-Ezeanyanwu, 2017). For example, Dangote Cement (a Nigerian multinational) setting up its manufacturing plants in Algeria. Additionally, Ross (2020) defined offshoring as the setting up of an organisation's production operations overseas. Often offshoring is referred to as production relocation or offshore outsourcing (Ross, 2020).

According to Koubek, Weinert, and Meyer (2009), offshoring is a subcategory of outsourcing. When we talk about outsourcing, we usually mean the externalization of formerly in-house operations to a third party. In this case, the third party is commonly an outsourcing contractor. Conversely, the third party may also be a member of the outsourcing company, such as a subsidiary. The international factor distinguishes offshoring from outsourcing. Outsourcing may occur solely in a national setting. However, in the case of offshoring, the third party is based in a foreign nation.

2.3 Blessings of Foreign Outsourcing and Offshoring

Adoption of foreign outsourcing and offshoring have been shown to impact organisations positively. Several 'blessings' of foreign outsourcing and offshoring have been suggested, these include cost saving, access to competent manpower, help in managing risk, exposure to new technologies, reduces nepotism and favouritism, overall foreign outsourcing and offshoring increase efficiency and effectiveness since the outsourcing firm is allowed to focus on core areas needing more attention (Agyemang, Aikins, Asibey, & Osei-Broni, 2014; Abdullahi & Sallau, 2019).Some of these blessings of foreign outsourcing and offshoring are discussed below:

i. Cost Reduction:Organizations may certainly lower their expenditures by outsourcing since outsourced services are more affordable. Multinational corporations can minimize their recruitment, operational and overhead costs by outsourcing of offshoring. For example, outsourcing eliminate the payment of severance package since the worker is not under the direct employer of the outsourcer.
ii. Access to Experienced Manpower: Outsourcing and offshoring can give organisations easy access to competent human resources. Furthermore, organizations may outsource some functions without having to invest in the training and development of personnel doing the specific service. Staff of an outsourcing partner are expected to have required skill-set and experiences since they have received specific and adequate training, and also worked in different settings. Therefore, are skilled and highly competent and made.
iii. Help in Managing Risk: Multinationals may overcome unproductiveness caused by natural or man-made disasters, as well as needless complaints such as illness, fatalities, labour strikes, and wage concerns, since the outsourcing partner consistently adheres to the deal and must deliver services as long as the deal is in effect. Other disasters, such as market swings or technological crises, may also be protected since such outsourcing partners, particularly at the international level, have robust disaster recovery systems and thorough backup plans that will aid in speedy reaction and putting operations back on course.
iv. Reduces Nepotism and Favouritism: Organizational leaders frequently ignore the flaws or shortcomings of friends and family, but when a service like security is outsourced, failing to execute it correctly will cost the

outsourcing company.Organizational leaders may not have personal relationships with their employees, notably if the outsourcing partner is from another country or state.

v. Exposure to New Technologies: Foreign outsourcing and offshoring help open doors for local firms to access to new and advanced technologies which will be made available by outsourcing partners. This is very important for organisations such as hospitals, telecommunications since they made use of state-of-the-art and fast changing equipment.
vi. Help Outsourcer toFocus on Core: Several multinationals outsource to minimize distractions and focus on key strengths.
vii. Enhance Global Competition: Another reason for foreign outsourcing or offshoring is because competition is increasing as a result of globalisation. Businesses now compete not only within their locality or with other enterprises in their sector, but also with firms from other nations and across sectors.

2.4 Curses of Foreign Outsourcing and Offshoring

Notwithstanding the many benefits associated with foreign outsourcing and offshoring, there are also several potential risks and threats. First, the process of foreign outsourcing and offshoring encourages over-reliance on foreign currency (Iqbal & Munir, 2013) and the dollarization of the world economy has led to large trade deficits that threatens the sustainability,competitiveness and survival of growing economies such as Nigeria (Aigbavboa, & Mbohwa, 2020). There is also risk of exposing sensitive data; quality risk, hidden cost and shrinking talent pool (Wickford, 2003; Umaru, 2013; Abdullahi & Sallau, 2019). Some of the curses of foreign outsourcing and offshoring are discussed below:

i. Creation of Over-Reliance: Personal personnel with technological prowess, experience, and expertise will continue to be lost as the organization continues to outsource multiple or specialized activities. When such an activity may only be carried out by an outsourcing firm, an organization becomes too reliant on foreign provision. Recognizing this can cause the outsourcing partner to request extra money, a modification in the contract arrangement, or even arrogance feelings of ridiculous arguments.
ii. Shrinking in Talent Pool: Outsourcing has the potential to deplete a nation's domestic talent pool as a result of the outsourcing of technologically related jobs to other countries. For example, the number of students majoring in high-tech studies may decline, as was the case at the South California Centre for Management Communication, which saw a 19 percent drop in undergraduate Computer Science enrolment and a further 23 percent drop in new Computer Science majors due to a lack of new Computer Science majors as a result of low employment opportunities.
iii. Risk of Exposing Organisation’s Confidential Data or Information: This is due to the fact that the outsourced service will be made available to the corporation that will continue to run it. When a company outsources, the outsourcing partner's employees are immediately placed in the same setting as the company's employees. This method, over time, can disclose a great deal of detail, confidentiality, and even details about an organization. As a result, there is a chance of revealing classified information.
iv. Possible Loss of Morale, Loyalty and Decline in Productivity: Employees may be dissatisfied because globalization has resulted in the lack of stable work options, lower wages without health or social care, and life and retirement compensation.
v. Increase Unemployment Rate: When a company outsources a project to a foreign company, the country's economy and other residents are denied job opportunities, contributing to a rise in loss of jobs and harm to local workers.
vi. Quality risks: Also, since the degree of Service Level Agent (SLA) is a good indicator of the quality of service in personnel outsourcing, SLA can be deficient in badly specified contractual agreements and poorly performed priorities, the quality of service is generally not commensurate with the expense.
vii. Conflict Tendency in Case of Failure: Failure to reach the agreed-upon goal will result in conflict. This issue may be caused by indecent, unethical, insufficient, or inappropriate facilities, which may contribute to severe conflict. Intra-conflict or inter-conflict situations may occur, and both have consequences.
viii. Extension of Corruption: Heads of organizations, especially in Developing Countries like Nigeria where corruption is rampant, can manipulate outsourcing of specific services to their benefit, by outsourcing to businesses in which they have shares, or their friends, family, or relatives' families, or even using it for other socio-political purposes.
ix. Hidden Cost: Outsourcing can also come with a lot of hidden costs, particularly if this is done across international borders, and it can be a major danger to the existing economy. For example, if Africa's ideology of White Man's Dominance Complex is applied to all outsourcing problems, our continent's current professional workers who can perform equivalent tasks would be unable to be utilized.

III. Methodology

This study followed the qualitative approach. This was appropriate because the study made use of qualitative data (interviews). The study focuses on multinational corporations operating in Port Harcourt, The Rivers State capital. The participants were selected using purposive and snowballing sampling techniques. First, the researchers contacted 50 managers of multinational corporations via email, WhatsApp and telephone calls. However, only eleven (11)responded positively. This comprises 4 managers from telecommunication firms, 2managers from manufacturing firms and 5 managers from oil services firms. After interviewing these 11, they were asked to recommend at least one of their colleagues who they believe have the required knowledge and experience to discuss on the study variables. From this process a further 11 managers were interviewed, making a total of twenty-two (22) participants.

The interview protocol was made up of two parts. Part one focused on the demographic details of the interviewee, while the second part has ten (10) question items on the study variables (foreign outsourcing and offshoring). Lastly, the respondents were asked if they have any other thing to say.

IV. Data Analyses and Interpretation

To analyse the qualitative data generated, the Nvivo software was adopted. The software was appropriate because of its many features, flexibility, benefits and advantage over other qualitative data analysis software such as ATLAS, XSIGHT, Weft QDA (Flick, 2018; Dalkin, Forster, Hodgson, Lhussier, & Carr, 2021).

The interviews were recorded using a recorder and transcribed into word format, using Microsoft word software (doc.), and was converted into rich text file format (.rtf extensions) for easy importation into the Nvivo software, the Nvivo software aided in preparation of the qualitative data (Kalpokas, & Radivojevic, 2019, 2021; Schmieder, 2020).

4.1 Analyses on Blessings of Foreign Outsourcing and Offshoring

The interviewees were questioned on what foreign outsourcing and offshoring as well as the benefits and drawbacks of foreign outsourcing and offshoring. When asked about what they understand by foreign outsourcing and offshoring. Majority of the interviewees describe foreign outsourcing has the practice of taking their production to a foreign country. Some described foreign outsourcing as hiring a foreign partner to perform a function for the company, while offshoring involve performing some business function in a country other than where the products or services are actually developed or manufactured. That is, the manufacturing of some components by a contracting firm in another country.

When asked if their companies practice outsourcing and offshoring. Some respondents responded in the affirmative. One respondent noted that:

> When it has to do with functions that needs specialists, we allowed our foreign partners to help us out.

Another respondent added that:

> We have partnerships with Chinese and Indian firms, for most of our functions involving sophisticated technologies. But almost all of our production is done here in Nigeria. We do not take our production outside since the cost of labour is cheaper here.

Another respondents working with an oil servicing firm, answered that:

> Virtually all of our machines and equipment are imported and highly complex, so we mostly rely on our foreign partners/contractors for their installations, operations and repairs.

When asked if their companies have benefited from foreign outsourcing. Almost all participants responded in the affirmative.

One of the respondent said:

> My company can't survive without outsourcing because our industry rely heavily on technology which changes at the speed of light. Our foreign partners come with a lot of experience and help keep up with technological changes. Hence helping us to save time and cost.

Another participant, said that, his company gained competitive edge by outsourcing some functions.

> We have Indian firms who are in charge of our I.T, this has made our online services very effective. Our customers rate our online platforms as the best in the telecommunication industry. Outsourcing also give us access to more experts.

A respondents working with a manufacturing firm. Responded that:

> Outsourcing is key to our success because it enables us give full attention to what matters most.

He further noted that:

> Thecompany can concentrate on strengthening and improving core business functions. Nevertheless, foreign outsourcing gives peace of mind.

As earlier mentioned, NVivo 11 a Computer Aided Qualitative Data Analysis Software (CAQDAS) was deployed to organise and analyse the interview data. When the digital files were imported as new project into NVivo 11, key words and phrases were identified and subsequently visualised through cloud. Figure 4.1 is the word cloud of the various themes and their descriptors that emanated from the analysis on blessings of foreign outsourcing and offshoring.

Figure 4.1: Word Cloud from Qualitative Analysis on Blessing of Foreign Outsourcing and Offshoring Using NVivo 11.

Source: Research Data, 2021.

Figure 4.1 indicates that cost reduction is the most visible theme. This is followed by access to competent manpower,focus on core activities, access to new technologies, help manage risk and reduce nepotism and favouritism.

4.2 Analyses on Curses of Foreign Outsourcing and Offshoring

Some disadvantages of foreign outsourcing were also unearthed during the interview. One respondents who is with a telecommunication firm. Observed that:

> We do not have control over some of our functional areas due to outsourcing.

A respondents working with an oil services firm. Answered that:

> Despite the contributions of foreign outsourcing to my firm. It has its drawback. First, we are gradually losing focus has we have outsourced almost every aspect of our business. Secondly, we do not have total control over quality. Lastly, foreign outsourcing is financially burdensome, especially considering the exchange rate.

The second part of the interview focused on offshoring. Answers show that, majority of the companies do not offshore. When asked if they offshore, a respondent with a manufacturing firm opine that:

> We do not have the funds to take our production outside. If we have challenges we bring the experts here.

When asked of the benefits of offshoring. Majority said that offshoring helps improve their product/service quality. Also, it gives them access to hi-tech not available in the country. One of the respondents answered:

> Taking our production of some components of our products to China and Taiwan gives us access to their technology which in turn enhance the quality of our products.

Another respondent added:

> These guys have sophisticated technology which makes their finishing superb. You do not have that expertise here or will I say, we haven't gotten to their level.

When asked about the negative effect of offshoring. They participants complained about the loss of jobs opportunities. Also, they complained that offshoring may lead to low self-esteem on the long run. They also mention capital flight among other negatives of offshoring. A participant with a telecommunication firm observed that:

> We rely on South Africans for most of our technical services. This has limited us (Nigerians) from developing our skills in this aspect of telecommunication technology.

A respondent from an oil firm supported this view, by submitting that:

> Most times we cannot hold our foreign partners liable for their mistakes since they are not here. This sometimes affect our production negatively.

Figure 4.2 is the word cloud of the various themes and their descriptors that emanated from the analysis on curses of foreign outsourcing and offshoring.

Figure 4.2: Word Cloud from Qualitative Analysis on Curses of Foreign Outsourcing and Offshoring Using NVivo 11.

Source: Research Data, 2021.

Figure 4.2 indicates that over-reliance on foreigners is the most visible theme. This is followed by shrinking talent pool, exposure of company's data, hidden cost and corruption.

4.3Discussion of Findings

The salient points raised by the interviewees show that multinational corporations in Nigeria engages in foreign outsourcing and very little offshoring. The interview also revealed that, both strategies have their good (blessings) and bad (curses). This is in tandem with the submission of Aigbavboa and Mbohwa (2020), Wickford (2003), Umaru (2013), and Abdullahi and Sallau (2019). The outcome of the interviews revealed that, majority of the respondents see foreign outsourcing and offshoring as distinct but related corporate strategies use by multinational corporations to achieve competitive edge.

The participants agreed that foreign outsourcing is a managerial practice of giving out some business functions or process to third parties in other countries. This definition is in consonant with the definition of Abdullahi and Sallau (2019), who defined foreign outsourcing as the procuring of material, managerial inputs or services by a company from sources outside the firm, especially foreign firm. Similarly, participants see offshoring as the setting up of an organisation's production operations overseas, which in line with Ross' (2020) definition of offshoring as production relocation or offshore outsourcing. The analysis also revealed several blessings as well as curses of foreign outsourcing and offshoring. Among the blessings include access to high and current technology, access to competent manpower, cost minimization and improve quality. The curses include job loss, exposure of sensitive information and over-reliance on foreign partners.

V. Conclusion

The study concluded that foreign outsourcing and offshoring can be blessings orcurses to the multinational corporation. Whether these corporate strategies will be blessings or curses to the multinational corporation depends on the when and how they are applied. Furthermore, it was concluded that, foreign outsourcing and offshoring are trendsin international business that are changing the international business operations and presenting challenges as well as opportunities to multinational corporations which if well applied maybe a blessing otherwise can become a curse.

Recommendations and Policy Implications

Based on the conclusion above, the management of multinational enterprises are expected to:

i. Embarkmore on foreign outsourcing to gain benefits of cost minimization, access to latest technology and competent manpower.

ii. Take the outsourcing and offshoring process seriously to ensure positive outcomes. Specifically, the terms of contract should be stated clearly and communicated to employees of both parties. Also, policies should be raised to safe guide the companies' information.

iii. Lastly, the multinational corporations should ensure that, the costs of managing the outsourcing and offshoring process is not more than the benefits generated by the adopting the strategies.

Limitations of the Study and Avenue for Further Research

This study is not without limitations. First, data were collected from only twenty-two participants. Future studies can enhance the findings of this study by expanding it to include more participants. Secondly, the study relied only on qualitative data, it is recommended that other scholars should adopt data triangulation by using both quantitative and qualitative data. Lastly, the instrument used in this study has not been validated, hence further studies are needed to developed, test and validate the research instrument. This can be done by using exploratory and confirmatory factor analysis.

References

[1]. Abdullahi, M., & Sallau, A. S. (2019). Benefits and challenges of outsourcing on service delivery: Lessons for Nigerian public organisations. *University of Port Harcourt Journal of Management*, 4(4), 26-34.

[2]. Agyemang, P.; Aikins, I.; Asibey, I. & Osei-Broni, A. (2014). Evaluating the impact of outsourcing of non-core functions in the hotel industry: Case study of Anita, Noda and Golden Gate Hotels. *European Journal of Business and InnovationResearch*, 2(3), 25-45.

[3]. Aigbavboa, S., & Mbohwa, S. (2020). The murky waters of outsourcing: critical risks factors of outsourcing pharmaceutical outbound value chains. *Procedia Manufacturing*, 43, 328–335.

[4]. Aleksandre A., Uday, A., Esko, P., Mikko, R., & Timo, S. (2019). Impact of accounting process characteristics on accounting outsourcing - Comparison of users and non-users of cloud-based accounting information systems. *International Journal of Accounting Information Systems*, 34, 1-18.

[5]. Alexandrova, M. (2009). International outsourcing: Incentives, benefits and risks for the companies in SEE countries. Presented at 4th International Conference of Association of Economic Universities of South and East Europe and Black Sea Region, Bucharest, Romania, 2009.

[6]. Asatiani, A., Penttinen, E., & Kumar, A. (2019). Uncovering the nature of the relationship between outsourcing motivations and the degree of outsourcing: An empirical study on Finnish small and medium-sized enterprises. *Journal of Information Technology*, 34(1), 39-58.

[7]. Brainard, L., & Litan, P. E. (2004). Services offshoring: Bane or boon and what to do*? CESifo Forum*, 5(2), 3–7.

[8]. Clark, D. E. (2007). Outsourcing lead optimization: constant change is here to stay. *Drug Discovery Today*, 12(1-2), 62-70.

[9]. Coase, R. H. (1937). The nature of the firm. *Economica N.S*, 4, 386–405.

[10]. Dalkin, S, Forster, N, Hodgson, P., Lhussier, M., & Carr, S. M. (2021). Using computer assisted qualitative data analysis software (CAQDAS; NVivo) to assist in the complex process of realist theory generation, refinement and testing. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 24, 123–134.

[11]. Dan-Jumbo, C. T., & Akpan, E. E. (2018). The promises and perils of multinational corporations: The Nigerian experience. *International Journal of Management Science and Business Administration*, 4(3), 73-78.

[12]. Eluka, J., Uzoamaka, N. P., & Anekwe, R. I. (2015). Multinational corporations and their effects on Nigerian economy. *European Journal of Business and Management,* 8((9), 69-78.

[13]. Erber, G., & Sayed-Ahmed, A. (2005). Offshore outsourcing: A global shift in the present IT industry. *Intereconomics*, 40(2), 100–112.

[14]. Farrell, D. (2004). Beyond offshoring: Assess your company's global potential. *Harvard Business Review*, 82(12), 82–90.

[15]. Flick, U. (2018). *An introduction to qualitative research*. London: SAGE.

[16]. Francis, M. N., Igwe, A. A., & Victor-Ifeanyi, I. (2020). The growth and development of multinational enterprises. *Journal of Business and Management,* 22(5), 45-56.

[17]. Hayler, D. (2015). Exploring outsourcing as a source of competitive advantage. A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment for the degree of Doctor of Business Administration, Kingston University.
[18]. Ivwurie, E.A., &Akpan, E.E. (2021). Strategic corporate social responsibility and organisational sustainability of multinational corporations in Nigeria. *Research Journal of Business and Management*, 8(2), 51-61.
[19]. Kalpokaite, N., & Radivojevic, I. (2019). Demystifying qualitative data analysis for novice qualitative researchers. *The Qualitative Report*, 24(13), 44–57.
[20]. Kalpokas, N., &Radivojevic, I. (2021). Bridging the gap between methodology and qualitative data analysis software: A practical guide for educators and qualitative researchers. *Sociological Research Online* (Ahead of print)
[21]. Kayumba, C. U. (2019). *Effect of outsourcing on organizational performance in Rwanda*. An unpublished master's thesis submitted to Umeå School of Business and Economics.
[22]. Koubek, N., Weinert, S., & Meyer, K. (2009). Outsourcing and offshoring strategies of multinational companies in Asia. *ASEAN*, 3, 205–222.
[23]. Logan, M. S. (2000). Using agency theory to design successful outsourcing relationships. *The International Journal of Logistics Management*, 11(2), 21–32.
[24]. Mostafa, T. S., & Roorda, M. J. (2017). Discrete choice modeling of freight outsourcing decisions of Canadian manufacturers. *Transportation Research Record*, 2610(1), 76-86.
[25]. Okeke-Ezeanyanwu, J. A. (2017). Impact of outsourcing on organizational productivity in private and public sector organizations in Anambra State. *African Journal of Education, Science and Technology*, 3(4), 112-116.
[26]. Rindfleisch, A. (2020). Transaction cost theory: past, present and future. *Academy of Marketing Science Review*, 10, 85–97.
[27]. Ross, L. (2020). *Offshoring vs. outsourcing: What's the difference*? https://www.thomasnet.com/insights/offshoring-vs-outsourcing/
[28]. Schmieder, C. (2020). Qualitative data analysis software as a tool for teaching analytic practice: Towards a theoretical framework for integrating QDAS into methods pedagogy. *Qualitative Research* 20(5), 684–702.
[29]. Umaru, U. D. (2013). *Impacts of outsourcing services on the operations of federal establishments in Borno state, Nigeria*. PhD Thesis, University of Maiduguri, Maiduguri (unpublished).
[30]. Wang, Y., & Zhou, G. (2021). Interaction mechanism between the logistics industry and manufacturing industry–based on the perspective of different linkage types. *IEEE Access* (Ahead print).
[31]. Wickford, H. (2003). *Negative effects outsourcing has on organisations*. Retrieved 25th May, 2021 from http://smallbusiness.chron.com.
[32]. Yeboua, K. (2020). Foreign direct investment and economic growth in Africa: New empirical approach on the role of institutional development. *Journal of African Business*, (In press).

In-depth Interview Protocol
Name of Interviewer: Ekom Etim Akpan, Okechi Obiora Anthony and Anthony AniagbaosoIgwe
Date:
Name of Interviewee:
Designation of Interviewee:
Start Time: …………
End Time: ……………
Demographic Details:

i. Please may we meet you Sir/Ma?
ii. Where do you work?
iii. What is your current job title?

Discussion on Foreign Outsourcing

i. Kindly tell us what foreign outsourcing mean to you?
ii. Does your company practice foreign outsourcing? If yes, please tell us how?
iii. How has foreign outsourcing affected your company's bottom-line?
iv. Can you tell how your company has benefited from foreign outsourcing?
v. Based on your personal experiences, what are the disadvantages of foreign outsourcing to your firm?
vi. Is there any other thing you would like to say about foreign outsourcing?

Discussion on Offshoring

i. What do you understand by offshoring?
ii. Does your organisation adopt offshoring? If yes, kindly discuss the areas your company uses offshoring.
iii. What benefits does your company derive from offshoring?
iv. Have your company experienced any negative effect from offshoring, if yes, please explain.
v. Is there any other thing you would like to say about offshoring?

Thank you for time.